

APIL Guide to Evidence

General Editor

Stephen Glynn
9 Gough Square, London

Contributor Authors

Laura Elfield
Christopher Goddard
Philip Jones
Linda Nelson
Jennifer Newcomb
Esther Pounder
Shahram Sharghy
Rajeev Shetty
Christopher Stephenson
all of 9 Gough Square, London

and

Edwina Rawson, Partner
Field Fisher Waterhouse LLP

Maria Panteli, Solicitor
Leigh Day & Co

Christine Tallon, Solicitor
Leigh Day & Co

Published by
Jordan Publishing Limited
21 St Thomas Street
Bristol BS1 6JS

Whilst the publishers and the authors have taken every care in preparing the material included in this work, any statements made as to the legal or other implications of particular transactions are made in good faith purely for general guidance and cannot be regarded as a substitute for professional advice. Consequently, no liability can be accepted for loss or expense incurred as a result of relying in particular circumstances on statements made in this work.

© Jordan Publishing Ltd 2011

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any way or by any means, including photocopying or recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher.

Crown Copyright material is reproduced with kind permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978 0 85308 756 4

Typeset by Letterpart Ltd, Reigate, Surrey

Printed in Great Britain by CPI Antony Rowe, Chippenham, Wiltshire

CONTENTS

Preface	v
Association of Personal Injury Lawyers (APIL)	vii
Table of Cases	xvii
Table of Statutes	xxv
Table of Statutory Instruments	xxvii
Chapter 1	
Introduction	1
The importance of evidence	1
Integral to all aspects of personal injury litigation	2
Scope of this guide	2
Source material	3
Part 32 written evidence	4
Part 35 expert evidence	6
Protocols	7
Chapter 2	
Initial Steps	11
Introduction	11
Witness evidence	11
The claimant's first statement	12
Exhibiting documents	15
CPR requirements for a witness statement	15
Obtaining the police accident report	17
The RIDDOR report and accident book	19
Earnings details	20
Pension loss	20
Special damages	21
Other witnesses	22
Photographs	24
The Rehabilitation Code 2007 (annex D of the PI Protocol)	24
The Immediate Needs Assessment	25
Appendix: The 2007 Rehabilitation Code	26
Chapter 3	
Liability Investigations/Enquiries	31
Disclosure & the pre-action protocols	31
The pre-action protocols generally	31

The Personal Injury Protocol	32
Clinical Negligence Protocol	33
Disease and Illness Pre-Action Protocol and the Mesothelioma Practice Direction	33
Investigations in industrial disease cases	35
Proving breach of duty: consideration of relevant safety standards	37
Health and Safety Executive Guidance	37
Health and Safety Executive approved codes of practice	38
Highways Maintenance Code of Practice	41
Obtaining documents from the Health and Safety Executive	41
Experts' reports	42
Evidential status of previous judgments	44
General rule	44
Exceptions to the rule in <i>Hollington</i> (prior convictions)	45
Prior civil judgments	46
Inquest	48
Appendix 1: Pre-action personal injury protocol standard disclosure lists	49
Appendix 2: Medical negligence and personal injury claims, a protocol for obtaining hospital medical records	55
Chapter 4	
Medical Records	63
Solicitors and medical records	63
Guide to obtaining medical records	63
Step 1: Identify and apply for the records	63
Who can apply	65
Step 2: Keep a good record	66
Step 3: Ordering and paginating the records and preparing the index	66
Step 4: Reading the medical records	67
Step 5: Updating the records	68
Statutory framework	69
Access to Health Records Act 1990	70
Data Protection Act 1998	71
Freedom of Information Act 2000	73
Charging for copy medical records	73
Medical records and limitation periods	74
Pre-action protocols	74
Incident reports and other documents	75
Missing and inconsistent medical records	77
Confidentiality	79
Applying to court for records	79
Claimants' applications	81
Defendants' applications	81
Timing of request	84
Applications to third parties	85

Hospitals' duty to protect confidentiality	85
Obligations of experts to protect confidentiality	86
Ownership of medical records	86
Content of medical records	87
Hospital records	87
GP records	87
Chapter 5	
Medical Examinations	89
Introduction	89
Selecting an expert	89
Finding the expert	89
Choosing the expert	90
Proportionality	90
Use of care and employment experts	91
Use of the treating doctor as an expert	91
Getting the best out of an expert	93
The medico-legal context	93
Instructions to the expert	94
Ensuring that the report is adequate	95
Preparing the claimant for the medical examination	96
Before the examination	96
During the examination	97
After the examination	97
Unreasonable refusal and stays	98
The test	98
Objection to a particular test	98
Objection to particular doctor	99
Attendance of a friend	100
Attendance of claimant's own expert	100
Appendix: Glossary of experts – who does what?	101
Chapter 6	
Expert Evidence	105
Introduction	105
Admissibility of opinion evidence	105
Duties of an expert	105
CPR Part 35 and the protocol	106
Conflict of interest	107
Facts and opinion	109
Rejecting expert evidence	109
Conditional and contingency fees	110
Expert witness summons	110
Failure to comply with the rules	112
Pre-action protocols ('PAPs')	113
Instructing experts under the Pre-Action Protocol for Personal Injury Claims ('PI Protocol')	113

Pre-Action Protocol for the Resolution of Clinical Disputes ('Clinical Negligence Protocol')	116
Pre-Action Protocol for Disease and Illness Claims ('Disease and Illness Protocol')	117
The NHS redress scheme	119
Instructions to an expert	120
Immunity	120
Privilege	121
Privilege in earlier reports or drafts of reports	122
Financial factors which may impact on your choice of expert	123
Publicly funded cases	123
Legal expenses insurance	125
Discussions between experts	125
Single joint experts	128
Jointly selected	128
Jointly instructed expert	129
Instructing a joint expert	131
Expert's fees	132
Challenging a joint report	132
Questions to experts	133
Persuading the court to allow expert evidence	135
One expert per specialism	137
Appendix: Model Directions for Clinical Negligence Cases (2010)	138
Chapter 7	
Witness Evidence	151
Admissibility and relevance	151
Competence and compellability	152
Compelling attendance: witness summonses	153
Witness summons and disclosure	154
Permission to issue a witness summons	154
Setting aside or varying a witness summons	154
Issue and service of the witness summons	155
Witnesses at trial	156
Witnesses not attending trial	157
Depositions	157
Witness within the jurisdiction	157
Conduct of the examination	158
Unco-operative witness	159
Use of the deposition	159
Witness outside the jurisdiction	159
States where the Taking of Evidence Regulation does not apply	160
Regulation states	161
Video conferencing	161
Civil Evidence Act notices	163
Use of statement of absent witness	165
Proceedings other than trials	165

Form and content of witness statements etc	166
Form of witness statements	167
Verification	167
Alterations	168
Foreign language statements	168
Witness summaries	168
Use of witness statement for collateral purpose	169
Privilege and immunity	169
Chapter 8	
Video and Other Evidence	171
Video evidence	171
Admissibility of video evidence	172
Excluding or permitting video evidence	172
The balancing exercise	173
Disclosure of video evidence	175
Historical context	175
Current position: CPR Part 31	175
Timing of disclosure	176
Late disclosure	177
Full disclosure	179
Assessing video evidence	180
Costs	181
Deliberate exaggeration	182
Contempt of court	184
Other evidence	184
Plans, photographs and other documents	184
Chapter 9	
Procedural Steps	187
Introduction	187
Pre-action disclosure	187
Why make an application?	188
The test for pre-action disclosure	188
Likely to be a party	188
If proceedings had started	189
Desirability	189
How to make an application	190
Costs of the application	191
Transfer of proceedings	192
Allocation	192
Allocation questionnaires	192
Allocation of the claim	193
Scope of each track	193
Disclosure and inspection of documents	195
Standard disclosure	195
Electronic disclosure	196
Procedure for standard disclosure	196

Applications for specific disclosure or inspection	198
Inspection	198
Exceptions to right to inspection	198
Claim to withhold disclosure/inspection	199
Once disclosure has taken place	199
Disclosure applications against non-parties	200
Exchange of witness statements	200
Exchange of expert evidence	201
Meetings of experts	201
Agendas	202
Attendance of lawyers	202
Pre-trial checklist	202
Small claims track	202
Fast track	202
Multi track	203
Bundles (CPR Practice Direction 39A, para 3.9)	204
Chapter 10	
The Role of Counsel	207
What is counsel's role?	207
Who can instruct counsel?	208
When to involve counsel	208
Instructions	209
Drafting	210
The advice on evidence	211
Counsel and the expert evidence	211
Advising in conference	212
Joint settlement meeting	213
Chapter 11	
Trial	215
Persuasive and evidential burden of proof	215
Conflict of evidence and findings of fact	217
Functions of the judge in relation to expert evidence	218
Common issues of burden of proof in personal injury litigation: negligence, contributory negligence, causation, mitigation	219
Res ipsa loquitur	220
Judicial notice	220
The Civil Procedure Rules and evidence at trial	221
Hearings in public – the general rule and exceptions	221
Admissibility	222
Proving facts	222
Witnesses	223
Trial bundles	223
Examination-in-chief	223
Cross-examination	224
Re-examination	226
Submission of no case to answer	226

Chapter 12	
Quantum Evidence	227
Heads of damage	227
General damages	227
Special damages	227
Gathering evidence to prove the loss	230
The claimant	230
The importance of the first interview	231
Statements from family and friends	231
Medical records	232
Types of medical records	232
Disclosure of medical records to the defendant	233
Medical evidence	234
Other helpful documents	235
Documentary proof	236
Receipts, invoices, valuations and estimates	236
Details of the claimant's employment	237
Self-employed claimant	238
The unemployed claimant	238
Employment evidence	238
Details of the claimant's care	239
Details of aids, equipment and appliances	241
Details of accommodation and housing expenses	242
Expert evidence	242
The need for expert evidence	242
Problems with particular experts	244
Care experts	245
Employment consultants	245
Forensic accountants	247
The schedule of loss	247
The purpose of the schedule of loss	248
The contents of the schedule of loss	249
The layout and form of the schedule of loss	250
Chapter 13	
Evidence on Appeal	253
The existing evidence	253
Fresh evidence	253
Interlocutory appeals	257
Fraud	257
Fraud at the appeal	258
The application	259
Index	261