

APIL Guide to Tripping and Slipping Cases

Second Edition

Charles Foster
Serjeants' Inn Chambers

Ben Bradley
Outer Temple Chambers

Published by
Jordan Publishing Limited
21 St Thomas Street
Bristol BS1 6JS

Whilst the publishers and the author have taken every care in preparing the material included in this work, any statements made as to the legal or other implications of particular transactions are made in good faith purely for general guidance and cannot be regarded as a substitute for professional advice. Consequently, no liability can be accepted for loss or expense incurred as a result of relying in particular circumstances on statements made in this work.

© Jordan Publishing Limited 2015

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any way or by any means, including photocopying or recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher.

Crown Copyright material is reproduced with kind permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978 1 78473 076 5

Typeset by Letterpart Limited, Caterham on the Hill, Surrey CR3 5XL

Printed in Great Britain by Hobbs the Printers Limited, Totton, Hampshire SO40 3WX

CONTENTS

Preface	v
Association of Personal Injury Lawyers (APIL)	vii
Table of Cases	xix
Table of Statutes	xxvii
Table of Statutory Instruments	xxxii
Chapter 1	
Selecting the Defendant	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Injuries on highways caused by failure to maintain	2
Highways repairable at the public expense	2
Who is the highway authority?	3
Liability for the torts of independent contractors	4
Authorisation of torts affecting highway	5
Withdrawal of support from land	6
Particularly hazardous acts	6
Collateral negligence	6
Negligent selection of contractor/insufficient men	7
Liability of occupiers for their independent contractors	7
Predecessors in title	7
Agreements between local highway authorities	7
Toll roads and concession agreements under the New Roads and Street Works Act 1991	7
The highway authority for a road ceases to be a trunk road	8
The highway authority for roads on bridges spanning different counties	8
Extinction of liability to repair	9
Highways repairable by private individuals or corporate bodies	9
How can non-highway authorities become liable to repair highways?	9
Concurrent liability of the highway authority	10
Does liability to repair provide grounds for an action for personal injuries?	10
Liability under charter	11
Independent contractors and extinction of liability to repair	11

	Approaches to bridges	11
	Highways which no one is liable to repair	11
1.3	Injuries on highways caused otherwise than by failure to maintain	12
	Injuries resulting from statutory works other than maintenance	12
	The New Roads and Street Works Act 1991	12
	‘Street’	12
	‘Street works’	12
	‘Street authority’	13
	Street Works Licences	13
	The Street Works Register	13
	Notice of Works	13
	General obligation: the conduct of works	13
	Reinstatement	14
	The statutory codes under the Public Utilities Street Works Act 1950	14
	Does breach of the statutory obligations sound in damages?	15
	Study the enabling statute and consider other causes of action	15
	Consider all possible defendants	15
	Can undertakers rely on the highway authority’s inspections?	16
	Responsibility to maintain things created	16
	Drains and manhole covers	16
	Negligence	16
	Failure to provide adequate street lighting	17
	Injuries resulting from the default of private individuals or non-statutory bodies	18
	Cellars and vaults	18
	Injuries on highways adjoining the property of a tort-feasor	18
	Ice	19
	Tree roots	19
	Fencing of dangers adjoining highways	19
	Damage to the highway by excavation of adjoining land	19
	Animals	20
1.4	Injuries other than on highways	20
1.5	General points	21
 Chapter 2		
The Definition, Classification and Creation of Highways		23
2.1	Introduction	23
	The statutory definition	23
2.2	Classification	23
	Carriageway highways	24
	General carriageway highways	24

	Trunk roads	24
	Special roads	24
	Principal roads	25
	Classified, county, main and metropolitan roads	25
	Non-carriageway highways	25
	Footpaths	25
	Public paths	25
	Bridleways	25
	Roads used as public paths	25
	Byways open to all traffic	26
	Cycle tracks	26
	Walkways	26
	Urban pedestrianised areas	26
2.3	Identifying the category of road	26
2.4	Problems of definition	27
	The circular argument	27
	The common law	29
	How highways are created	30
	By statute	30
	By common law	30
2.5	The adoption of highways	31
 Chapter 3		
The Structure of Local Government		33
3.1	Introduction	33
3.2	Responsibility for highways	34
3.3	Access to information about activities	35
 Chapter 4		
The Statutory Duty of Highway Authorities to Maintain		37
4.1	Introduction	37
	The interplay between HA 1980, s 41 and s 58	37
4.2	Nature of the duty	38
	Which highways are covered by the duty?	38
	To whom is the duty owed?	38
	The meaning of ‘maintenance’	39
	Is fault required?	43
	The ‘fabric’ of the highway and the extent of the s 41 duty	43
	Street furniture	43
	Water on the highway	43
	Grit, dirt and mud	44
	Negligence – a ‘sliver’ of hope in mud and grit cases?	45
	Summary – water, mud and grit	46
4.3	What the claimant has to prove	46
	When is a highway not reasonably safe?	46
	Wobbly paving stones	48
	Safety of the carriageway for pedestrians	49
	Country roads	50

	‘Winter maintenance’ cases: HA 1980, s 41, s 130 and s 150	50
4.4	The statutory defence	52
	The burden of proof	52
	The s 58(2) criteria	53
	The character of the highway and the traffic which was reasonably to be expected to use it (s 58(2)(a))	53
	The standard of maintenance appropriate for a highway of that character and used by such traffic (s 58(2)(b))	54
	The state of repair in which a reasonable person would have expected to find the highway (s 58(2)(c))	54
	Whether the highway authority knew, or could reasonably have been expected to know, that the condition of the part of the highway to which the action relates was likely to cause danger to users of the highway (s 58(2)(d))	54
	Where the highway authority could not reasonably have been expected to repair that part of the highway before the cause of action arose, what warning notices of its condition had been displayed (s 58(2)(e))	57
	Independent contractors	57
4.5	The Code of Practice: Well Maintained Highways	58
	Budgetary constraints	59
4.6	Common law defences	61
	Contributory negligence	61
	Inevitable accident or act of God	61
	Act of a third party	61
	Volenti non fit injuria	62
4.7	Evidence	62
Chapter 5		
Negligence		
5.1	Introduction	65
5.2	Defendants other than highway authorities	65
	Occupiers	65
	Hybrid situations	65
	Persons other than occupiers	66
	Statutory undertakers	66
	The care people can be expected to take of themselves	67
5.3	Negligence of highway authorities	67
	Pleading negligence	67
	Negligent performance of maintenance works	68
	Independent contractors	68
	Negligent decision-making resulting in personal injury	69
	Policy decisions and operational decisions	69
	The effect of s 39 of the Road Traffic Act 1988	70

Land not forming part of the highway	71
Contributory negligence	71
Chapter 6	
Nuisance	73
6.1 Introduction	73
6.2 Highway nuisances	73
The highway authority's duty to abate nuisance	73
6.3 <i>Valentine and Ali</i>	75
<i>Valentine v Transport for London and another</i> [2010]	
EWCA Civ 1358	75
<i>Ali v Bradford MDC</i> [2012] 1 WLR 161	75
Other possible causes of action in light of <i>Valentine and Ali</i>	76
6.4 Pursuing those who have directly created a nuisance	76
Defining a public nuisance on the highway	76
Owners of adjoining land	76
Privately maintainable highways	77
Further legal principles	77
Obstruction	77
Unreasonableness	77
Negligence	78
Foreseeability	78
Non-dangerous obstructions	79
Dangerous nuisances affecting the highway	79
Dangers on land adjoining the highway	80
Animals and their products	80
Liability of occupiers for nuisance caused by independent contractors	81
6.5 Relationship between public nuisance and the duty under HA 1980, s 41	81
6.6 Remedy	82
Chapter 7	
The Liability of Occupiers	83
7.1 Introduction	83
7.2 The meaning of 'occupier'	83
7.3 The duties of an occupier	85
To visitors	85
Children	85
Workmen and other visitors who know how to take care of themselves	85
Warnings	85
Dangers created by independent contractors	85
To non-visitors	86
7.4 Visitors and non-visitors	86
Implied licences and invitees of holders of rights of way	87
Access Agreements and Access Land	87
7.5 Accidents in shops	88

7.6	The 'system of inspection' defence	90
7.7	Users of public rights of way not maintainable at the public expense	91
7.8	Exclusion and restriction of liability	91

Chapter 8

The Liability of Landlords		93
8.1	Introduction	93
8.2	Negligence	93
8.3	Nuisance	94
8.4	The Defective Premises Act 1972	95
8.5	Contractual liability of landlords	96
	At common law	96
	Under the Landlord and Tenant Act 1985	97
	The implied duty	97
	The statutory defence	98
	Notice of the defect	98
	Basis of claim	98
	Relationship with s 4 of the Defective Premises Act 1972	98
	Under the Agricultural Holdings Act 1986, s 7	99

Chapter 9

Miscellaneous Statutory Duties in the Workplace		101
9.1	Introduction	101
9.2	General principles	101
9.3	The Workplace (Health, Safety and Welfare) Regulations 1992	102
	Commencement	103
	Application	103
	The duties	104
	General maintenance and repair	104
	Lighting	104
	Waste materials on floors	104
	Condition of floors and 'traffic routes'	104
9.4	Construction sites	105
9.5	Construction (Design and Management) Regulations 2007 (SI 2007/320) & 2015 (SI 2015/51)	105
	Commencement	105
	Application	106
	Obligations: safe place of work, traffic routes & lighting	106
	Safe place of work	107
	Traffic routes	107
	Lighting	108
9.6	The Work at Height Regulations 2005 (SI 2005/735)	108
	Application	108
	Obligations	108
9.7	The Docks Regulations 1988 (SI 1988/1655)	109
	Application	109
	Access to dock premises	110

	Lighting	110
9.8	Statutory defences	110
	‘Reasonably practicable’	111

Chapter 10

Preparing a Case 113

10.1	Introduction	113
10.2	First steps for the claimant	113
	Photographs, measurements and weather conditions	113
	Medical records	114
	Proofs of evidence	114
	Selecting the defendant	114
	Documents routinely disclosed in highway tripping cases	115
	Records of highway inspections	115
	Maintenance records	116
	Minutes of highway authority meetings	116
	Complaints records	116
	Accident records	117
	Records of the location of grit and salt boxes	117
	Other records	117
10.3	First steps for the defendant	117
	The site	117
	Records and proofs	117
	Repairs	118
10.4	Statements of case	118
	Particulars of Claim	118
	Defence	118
	Requests for Further Information	119
	Replies	120
10.5	Preparing a case for the claimant	120
	Instructing an expert	121
	Using the disclosed documents	122
	Checklist of records	123
	Seeking counsel’s advice	123
	The trial bundle	124
10.6	Preparing a case for the defendant	125
	The statutory defence	125
	Experts	125
	Giving disclosure	125
	Contributory negligence	125
10.7	Trial and afterwards	125

Appendix A

Precedents		127
A.1	Questionnaire for potential witnesses	127
A.2	General endorsement	130
A.3	Certificate of value	130
A.4	Letter of Claim	131

A.5	Letter to Meteorological Expert requesting weather records	132
A.6	Letter to Automobile Association requesting information about the state of roads	133
A.7	Particulars of Claim in a case of breach of statutory duty of a highway authority; negligence; nuisance	133
A.8	Defence in a case of breach of statutory duty of a highway authority; negligence; nuisance	136
A.9	Reply in a case of breach of statutory duty of a highway authority; negligence; nuisance	139
A.10	Part 20 Particulars of Claim in a case of breach of statutory duty of a highway authority; negligence; nuisance	141
A.11	Defence to Part 20 Particulars of Claim in a case of breach of statutory duty of a highway authority; negligence; nuisance	143
A.12	Request for further information relating to the defence where the defendant has merely pleaded the general words of s 58(1) of HA 1980	145
A.13	Request for further information relating to the defence seeking information about streetworks	146
A.14	Request for further information from the claimant	147
A.15	Particulars of Claim in an action against independent contractors engaged by a highway authority in respect of injuries caused by collateral negligence	148
A.16	Particulars of Claim in a highway tripping case involving a highway authority, a statutory undertaker and a building contractor: breach of statutory duty, negligence, nuisance	149
A.17	Defence: invoking the rule in <i>Gautret v Egerton/McGeown v Northern Ireland Housing Executive</i>	152
A.18	Particulars of Claim: customer slipping in a shop	153
A.19	Particulars of Claim in tripping accident in a factory: Breaches, (inter alia) of the Workplace (Health, Safety and Welfare) Regulations 1992	154
A.20	Particulars of Claim: tripping accident at premises which the claimant has paid to enter	156
A.21	Defence by the theatre owner/occupier in the above case, pleading that a warning was given	157
A.22	Particulars of Claim in action brought by non-tenant against landlord; Defective Premises Act 1972, s 4; negligence	159
A.23	Particulars of Claim: breach of a landlord's implied covenant to repair under s 11 of the Landlord and Tenant Act 1985	160
A.24	Defence by a landlord to an action brought as a breach of covenant under ss 11 and 11A of the Landlord and Tenant Act 1985 relying on s 3A of the 1985 Act	162
Appendix B		
Case Summaries		163
B.1	Introduction	163

B.2	Highways Act 1980, s 41	163
B.3	The defence under s 58	171
B.4	Evidence of failure to maintain	176
B.5	Non-delegability of the statutory duty	177
B.6	Default of another statutory undertaker	178
B.7	Highway out of repair	180
B.8	Boundaries of a highway	180
B.9	Negligence and the standard of care	181
B.10	Negligence of a highway authority	182
B.11	Independent contractors	184
B.12	Statutory undertakers	185
B.13	The owner of land adjoining the highway	189
B.14	Nuisance in general	189
B.15	Highway nuisance	190
Appendix C		
HSE Risk Assessment Materials		197
(1)	Preventing slips and trips at work: A Brief Guide	197
(2)	Risk Assessment: A Brief Guide to Controlling Risks in the Workplace	202
(3)	Assessing the Slip Resistance of Flooring	208
(4)	Slips and trips: Summary guidance for the food industry	215
Appendix D		
Civil Procedure Rules		223
	Practice direction – Pre-action Conduct	223
	Pre-Action Protocol for Personal Injury Claims	227
Appendix E		
Guidelines		237
	Extract from the Approved Code of Practice and Guidelines to the Management of Health and Safety at Work Regulations 1999	237
	Personal protective equipment at work (Second edition)	265
	Foot protection	265
Appendix F		
Safety at Street Works and Road Works Extract from the Code of Practice		267
Appendix G		
Photographs		277
Appendix H		
Addresses		287
Appendix I		
Well Maintained Highways – Code of Practice: Suggested Highway/Footway Hierarchy and Inspection Regimes		289

APPENDIX J	
Metric and Imperial Units of Length	295
Index	297